# Prompt Testing with Sighted Testers
# Full Report and Appendices

**TIMEFRAME**
December 2016 – March 2017

**Abstract**
A study was done to test two crowdsourcing protocols designed to engage visitors of the museum and to generate content that could be used by blind and low vision museum visitors. The results suggest that there are few significant differences between the two protocols in terms of the type of content created. However those using the "blind low vision" protocol on average want to contribute to the project more than those using the "friend" protocol. In addition, those people in the "blind low vision" protocol group tended to also be more interested in listening to this type of commentary. Participants who describe themselves as being more familiar with art or public speaking are more comfortable providing the content.

**EVALUATION GOALS**

**Guiding Research Question:**
How does the transference of agency over the interpretive process from organization to audience, via the crowdsourcing of visual descriptions, affect the visitor experience?

| Evaluation Questions | Method 1: Recording Visual Descriptions | Method 2: Follow-up Interviews |
|---|---|---|
| How do different prompts affect the audio description provided? Does the prompt used illicit different responses? (ie. Level/type of detail , personal stories/memories, ones that meet more criteria as 'accessible') | x | |
| How interested are visitors in contributing content? How interested are visitors in listening to crowdsourced content? | | x |
| How do visitors feel about creating crowdsourced visual descriptions? | | x |

**METHODOLOGY**

**Method 1: Recording Visual Descriptions**
This study compared the crowd-sourced descriptions created from two different prompts:

> GROUP A: "How would you describe this to a friend who is not in the room?
> GROUP B: "How would you describe this to a person who is blind?"

In each group, subjects were asked to describe three different works in order to become more comfortable with recording their description. See Appendices for Group A and B Protocols.

**Method 2: Follow-up interview**
Immediately following the visual description exercise, the data collector then asked the subject a set of follow-up interview questions. See Appendix for Interview Protocol.

**Data collection:** Both visual descriptions and interviews were recorded using digital recorders or the iPhone voice record feature. All recordings were transcribed.

**Sample size:** The team collected 19 interviews; 9 for the "friend" protocol (A), and 10 for the "blind low vision' (B) protocol.

**Introduction**
In the fall of 2014 the Access App project team first met to explore and discover their aspirations for the project and how they would attain them.  It became apparent that the team did not just want to meet the baseline accessibility requirements of the American Disability Act (ADA), but to reach beyond these and create best practices of audience engagement.  The ADA requirements in terms of interpretive provision are simply to have alternative means for accessing presented information in the exhibition; object labels or guidebook for example. Requirements would be met by creating audio transcripts or a means of reading the materials out loud.  While this may seem obvious, for a blind person, it also makes them <u>dependent</u> on their sighted companion. One goal of the Access App team is to facilitate <u>independent</u> access to content.

Another Universal Design principle the team wanted to explore is known as "Equitable Access". The team wanted to move beyond the basic ADA requirement of alternative routes to information, to thinking about ways to provide **equal quality of experience.** In addition to independence, equal quality of experience means access to understanding the broader context and environment of the exhibition, historic site or arts performance.  What is the shared emotional experience of other visitors and participants? This is where the crowdsourcing[1] aspect of the Access App enters the project.

---

[1] Crowdsourcing is the practice of engaging a 'crowd' or group for a common goal — often innovation, problem solving, or efficiency. Crowdsourcing can take place on many different levels and across various industries.

Crowdsourcing, in this case recording the reactions and descriptions of museum guests to three works of art, provides users of the Access App to 'eavesdrop on other peoples' experiences; what piqued their curiosity, other related (and sometimes unrelated but interesting stories), bits of knowledge and information that people want to pass on and share.[2]

The Access App team hoped to create tools that were useful and interesting as an interpretive experience for all users, not just those who are blind and low vision visitors. They intended to create a tool that could be used by deaf visitors, those with low cognition, and also those with motor skills challenges. However, it soon became apparent that the features needed by one group are quite different than the features needed by another. For this pilot it was decided to focus on blind and low vision users. With the intent of expanding to other groups at a future date.

The Access App Team decided to explore the question; "How does the transference of agency over the interpretive process from organization to audience via crowdsourcing of visual descriptions affect the experience of the visitor? More specifically, a pilot study and follow up study were designed to evaluate the instruments, and explore the larger research question as well as conduct a follow up interview with the participant to better understand their comfort level and level of engagement with the visual description exercise.

**FINDINGS**

**Methodology 1: Recording Visual Descriptions**

1. **How do different prompts affect the audio description provided? Does the prompt used illicit different responses?** (i.e. Level/type of detail , personal stories/memories, ones that meet more criteria as 'accessible') See Figure 1.

Descriptions are consistently longer in terms of both time and word count when given the blind/low vision prompt versus the friend prompt, but by very little. It is not a significant difference.

When the content of the three picture descriptions is broken down into visual descriptions, affect comments, interpretations and reference to museum resources one can see some slight differences, but given the small sample size, they are not be significant. Almost everyone in both groups provided visual information across all three pictures.

---

This phenomenon can provide organizations with access to new ideas and solutions, deeper consumer engagement, opportunities for co-creation, optimization of tasks, and reduced costs. This collective mobilization is crowdsourcing.
[2] Fritsch, 2017

The largest differences are seen in the 'affective' category.  Examples of these types of comments are;

> "fussy detail, but delightful",
> "nice, not my taste but they are pretty",
> "you feel a very natural warmth",
> "her expression is pensive and melancholy".

In general, those in the 'blind low vision' (B) group used more affective comments than the (A) group.  Curiously this was not true for one of the paintings, The Chandelier, where the frequency of affective comments were similar.

Roughly 90% of the 'friend group' (A) provided interpretive comments, just a bit higher than those in the 'blind low vision' group; 83%.  There also seems little difference in the nature of comments made in this category and the other categories as well.   Neither group noted that they rarely use museum content. At most one person in each group, for each picture, used museum generated content and for the Chandelier, no one used any (see Figure 1).

**Methodology 2: Follow up interviews**
The follow up interviews focused on three questions and some demographic data:

1.  **What did you think of the experience?** (see Figure 2)
    About a third of the participants felt that it was a difficult exercise and about the same found it easy or fun to do.  In some cases people were unsure that they had the background to do this, while another felt put on the spot.  Still another noted that it was more difficult to do this when someone was recording the description.

    Just under half of the participants, 8, reported that the process made them more engaged and that they were seeing the art more deeply than they would have if they were just going through on their own.

    > "makes you look at it a lot more than you probably would have done normally"
    > "good practice describing what you see versus what you think you see"
    > "made me look at it more than I probably would and maybe I'll remember it a little bit better…but definitely I think it made me look harder at what I was seeing"
    > "like it actually made me take a closer look and spend more time really figuring out the words that I was feeling.  It made me appreciate it more."
    > "it was a way to get you involved and think about what you're seeing I detail"

    Going a bit deeper into the comments, in all cases save one, the (B) group had more to say about the experience, but the general content seemed to be similar regardless of the group each was in. It did not seem to make a difference which group you were in regarding how they experienced the exercise.

2.  **On a scale of 1 to 10 with 1 being not all interested and 10 being very interested, how interested do you think you would be in <u>contributing</u> to something like this? (Follow up, can you tell me more about your rating?)** (see Figure 3.)

    On average, the 'friend' (A) group rated there level of interest to contribute as a 6.3[3], while the 'blind, low vision" (B) group averaged 7.1. There is no statistical difference between these two averages.

    Both groups hesitate more because of a lack of confidence, that they simply do not know enough. Even when people are enthusiastic about contributing only 3 people of the 19 felt they had the confidence to do it.

    Nor are there a lot of differences between what the two groups say except in the 'motivation to contribute' category. Here the 'blind, low vision' group talks a lot more about how they think this is a good idea for the visually impaired. The people in the 'friend' group talk about it adding structure to their day or maybe it is a way of getting into the museum for free. It seems a large qualitative difference.

3.  **On a scale of 1 to 10 with 1 being not all interested and 10 being very interested, how interested do you think you would be in <u>listening</u> to other visitors' audio descriptions to something like this? (Follow up, can you tell me more about your rating?)**

    On average, the 'friend' (A) group rated their level of interest as a 6.4 while the 'blind, low vision" (B) group averaged 7.2. There is no statistical difference between these two averages.

    It is clear that for listening it depends on the knowledge of the person they are listening to. In the (A) group 66% said that it would depend on how articulate or interesting the person was as to whether they would want to listen or not. In the (B) group this dropped to about 20%.

    The (A) group also had more to say about the barriers to listening to someone else describe the object. Two thirds of the group listed their preference for looking at the objects for themselves, reading all of the signs and coming to their own conclusions as the biggest barrier to listening. While not as frequent, about 40% in the (B) group said the same thing.

---

[3] In cases where a person gave a range, the higher number was used. In those instances where no number was given but their level of interest was clear, a number was provided, and if no number was provided and their level of interest could not be ascertained, they were omitted from the average.

**Discussion**
The purpose of the prompt study was to evaluate two protocols as a means of generating crowdsourced content for blind or low vision visitors. Nearly everyone provided visual descriptions, and the majority of participants also provided some interpretation of the artwork. More than half also made some affective comments. Only three people included something from the museum resources in their descriptions. While the sample size was small, there were directional differences in length of responses between the two conditions. However, these differences are not statistically significant. In terms of the descriptions themselves, there seems to be no significant differences between the groups.

Beyond the original research question, the results suggest that for many people, even though hard to do, the act of creating descriptions for others was engaging and appeared to get them to look more closely and deeply at the artwork. This was viewed as a positive experience. And the museum was given credit for trying the idea, especially in the (B) group. Still many felt that they were not qualified to do this.

When asked if they would be interested in listening to crowdsourced content most felt that it would be *most* interesting if the content were from knowledgeable people. There was less interest in hearing the content when generated by people with little or no experience other than as a curiosity. The largest barrier to listening was peoples' desire to read on their own the provided museum resources and draw their own conclusions. However at this stage in the project there is no data about actually listening to the crowdsourced descriptions so its potential impact is unknown.

It is clear that the exercise of creating content is an engaging way of involving many people in the museum experience even if considered difficult to do. As some suggested, having some time beforehand to have some mini-training, a chance to get thoughts together before recording, or perhaps a checklist to help guide them through the process may reduce some of the hesitancy. This is worth exploring as are creative ways of getting more visitors to create content.

While people were asked if they would be interested in listening to the crowdsourced content, the question has not been tested. There is often a large gap between what people think they would like and what they actually like. It is suggested that some of these descriptions be tested with people and get their actual reactions. This suggests several questions for further research:

1. What does a "successful/ideal" crowdsourced recording include? How do we prompt or guide visitors to create them? A good next step might be to create a list of criteria needed to create 'good' content.[4]

2. How would a tutorial video affect the nature and quality of audio descriptions? A less than 1 minute tutorial video—reminding visitors to include date, label,

---

[4] http://www.artbeyondsight.org/handbook/acs-guidelines.shtml

relative size…basic visual description info…this gets at how we frame the experience –what we hope to have in the end.

3. How do we test the content with the intended audience to see if it achieves the intended outcome?

4. How do we control for or avoid multiple crowdsourced entries with repeating content? Are there ways to 'bucket' the responses or prompt specific elements?

**Figure 1:** How do different prompts affect the audio description provided?
Content Coding of Picture Descriptions

| Group | Object | 1 – Visual Description | 2 – Affective Description | 3- Subjective Interpretation | 4- Museum Content |
|-------|--------|------------------------|---------------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------|
| A | Lucy Dodge Allen | 100% | 55% | 100% | 11% |
| B | Lucy Dodge Allen | 90% | 90% | 100% | 10% |
| | | | | | |
| A | Chandelier | 100% | 66% | 70% | 0% |
| B | Chandelier | 100% | 50% | 70% | 0% |
| | | | | | |
| A | Training Day | 100% | 33% | 100% | 22% |
| B | Training Day | 90% | 70% | 80% | 10% |
| | | | | | |
| A | **Average** | 100% | 51% | 90% | 11% |
| B | **Average** | 93% | 70% | 83% | 7% |

Figure 1: Percentages of responses that included one of the 4 attributes in their descriptions of the three paintings. 'A" is the 'friend' group and 'B' is the 'blind low vision' group. The last two rows represent the average percentage for each group across each attribute.

**Figure 2**: What did you think of the experience?

| Group | 1. Level of Difficulty, Confidence | 2. Level of Knowledge, Experience | 3. Descriptive of experience | 3a. What listeners may experience | 3b. Close looking | 4. Interests |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| A | 33% | 11% | 77% | 44% | 11.00% | 11.00% |
| B | 50% | 50% | 50% | 30% | 20.00% | 20.00% |

**Figure 2. What did you think of the experience?** The question was content coded into 5 attributes; Level of difficulty, Level of Knowledge, Description of Experience, Close Looking and Interests. 'A" is the 'friend' group and 'B' is the 'blind low vision' group. The percent of people in each group who made a comment in a particular attribute is shown. The percentages will not add up to 100 because in some cases people made more than one comment, and others no mention was made.

**Figure 3:** Interest in Contributing

| Group | Rating | 1a -- Level of Confidence /Comfort - negative | 1b -- Level of Confidence /Comfort - positive | 2 –Approach /Style | 3-- Motivations to contribute | 4-- Barriers to contribute |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| A | Avg 6.3/ 1-10 range | 33% | 11% | 11% | 33% | 22.00% |
| B | Avg+7.1/ 1-10 range | 50% | 20% | 10% | 70% | 10.00% |

**Figure 3 Interest in Contributing**; Shows the average for each group to the questions as well as the percentage of comments within each content coding category. 'A" is the 'friend' group and 'B' is the 'blind low vision' group. There is not difference in the averages at the .05 confidence level.

**Figure 4:** Interest in Listening

| Group | Rating | 1 - Motivations to listen | 1a. Valuing the expert voice | 1b. Valuing the Crowd sourced voice | 1c. Controlling the Quality of Recordings | 2-- Barriers to listen |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| A | Avg 6.4/ 1-9 range | 77% | 22% | 22% | 11% | 66.00% |
| B | Avg 7.2/ 5-10 range | 20% | 10% | 30% | 10% | 40.00% |

Figure 4: **Interest in Listening:** Shows the average for each group to the questions as well as the percentage of comments within each content coding category. There is not difference in the averages at the .05 confidence level.

**Crowdsourcing Visual Descriptions: Group A Protocol**
Access App Evaluation

---

*Hi. My name is _____. I work here at PEM. We are interested in hearing from visitors about some of the works in this gallery. Do you have a little time to give your feedback? [if yes] Great. It takes about 10 minutes and you can leave at any time. [if no] Okay, no problem. We hope you enjoy your visit.*

*Would it be OK if I recorded our conversation? It will make it easier to capture all of your thoughts. Your responses will remain anonymous and will only be used for research purposes. Is it OK if I record us? [if yes] Thank you. [If no] That's OK, I'll just write notes.*

---

### I. Prompting Descriptions

For each of the works below ask subject, "How would you describe this to a friend who is not in the room?" *Optional follow-up: "your description should only take a minute or two…just say what you see"*

| #1: Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | #2: Chandelier | #3: Salem Common on Training Day |
|---|---|---|
| | | |

### II.      Follow-Up Interview

1.      What did you think of that experience of describing what you see?

2.      The museum is working on a project where visitors will be able to record audio descriptions and share with other visitors. On a scale of 1 to 10, with 1 being not at all interested, and 10 being very interested), how interested do you think you would be in **contributing** to something like that? (Follow up: can you tell me more about your rating?)

| Not at all | | | | | | | | | Very |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |

On the same scale of 1-10, how interested would you be in **listening** to *other* visitors' audio descriptions? (Follow up: can you tell me more about your rating?)

| Not at all | | | | | | | | | Very |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |

**Please tell us more about you…**

**Is this your first time at Peabody Essex Museum?**
☐ Yes          ☐ No

**What is your age range?**
☐ 18-24       ☐ 25-34       ☐ 35-44       ☐ 45-54       ☐ 55-64       ☐ 65 or older

**What is your Occupation? _____**

**Circle the number that best describes you…**

| | Not at All | | | | Somewhat | | | | Very much | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Interested in art (in general) | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |
| Knowledgeable of art (in general) | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |

# THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME!

# Crowdsourcing Visual Descriptions: Group B Protocol
Access App Evaluation

*Hi. My name is _____. I work here at PEM. We are interested in hearing from visitors about some of the works in this gallery. Do you have a little time to give your feedback? [if yes] Great. It takes about 10 minutes and you can leave at any time. [if no] Okay, no problem. We hope you enjoy your visit.*

*Would it be OK if I recorded our conversation? It will make it easier to capture all of your thoughts. Your responses will remain anonymous and will only be used for research purposes. Is it OK if I record us? [if yes] Thank you. [If no] That's OK, I'll just write notes.*

## I. Prompting Descriptions
For each of the works below ask subject, "How would you describe this to a person who is blind or low vision?" *Optional follow-up: "your description should only take a minute or two…just say what you see"*

| #1: Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | #2: Chandelier | #3: Salem Common on Training Day |
|---|---|---|
|  |  |  |

## II. Follow-Up Interview

1. What did you think of that experience of describing what you see?

2. The museum is working on a project where visitors will be able to record audio descriptions and share with other visitors. On a scale of 1 to 10, with 1 being not at all interested, and 10 being very interested), how interested do you think you would be in **contributing** to something like that? (Follow up: can you tell me more about your rating?)

| Not at all | | | | | | | | | Very |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |

On the same scale of 1-10, how interested would you be in **listening** to *other* visitors' audio descriptions? (Follow up: can you tell me more about your rating?)

| Not at all | | | | | | | | | Very |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |

**Please tell us more about you…**

**Is this your first time at Peabody Essex Museum?**
☐ Yes          ☐ No

**What is your age range?**
☐ 18-24          ☐ 25-34          ☐ 35-44          ☐ 45-54          ☐ 55-64          ☐ 65 or older

**What is your Occupation?** _____

**Circle the number that best describes you…**

|  | Not at All |  |  |  | Somewhat |  |  |  | Very much |  |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Interested in art (in general) | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |
| Knowledgeable of art (in general) | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |

# THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME!

# Crowdsourcing Visual Descriptions:
Appendix A: Responses by Question

---

## I.  Prompting Descriptions
For each of the works below ask subject,
GROUP A: "How would you describe this to a friend who is not in the room?"
GROUP B "How would you describe this to a person who is blind or low vision?"
*Optional follow-up: "your description should only take a minute or two…just say what you see"*

| #1:  Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen |
| :---: |
|  |

| GROUP A: How would you describe this to a friend who is not in the room? | |
| :--- | :--- |
| A-AF01 | **[#1]**  AF01: A large oil portrait of a very pretty woman. Obviously placed in the European ruins kind of a background as opposed to…is this…supposedly New England that she's in…or? Yeah that's a mystery there…That's about as much as I could…yeah |
| A-AF02 | **[#1]**  AF02: Uhh well it appears that it is a classic, similar classic, portrait obviously from uh I would have said early 1800s, but uh. You know just a portrait of somebody quite well to do because its quite large…detail is pretty fine, probably pretty realistic, and of course with a classic background… and I guess that is the way I'd probably describe it. |
| A-AF03 | **[#1]**  AF03: Ohh, a portrait of a woman in the mid 19..uh sorry mid-1830s, so she's, I guess dressed very somberly, almost as if she is in mourning, and um, yeah she's looking straight at you, I guess not that much of an expression, just sort of staring straight ahead. She's got a shawl wrapped around her, very dark heavy black dress. A Roman looking ruins behind her. And a big red drape behind her as well. Yea… |
| A-AF04 | [#1]  AF04: Very large oil painting of a young lady, um, looks like she's visiting Italy or Greece, um…I wouldn't even know what period to say she is from, maybe the 1800s, um…black dress, quite dark, except for her face and shoulders, it's like the skins the main focus of the painting, um…that's it really. Pretty. |
| A-BD01 | **[#1]**  BD01: I would say that it was a 19th century portrait of a…some woman of means who is visiting Europe and she would be privileged to do at that time. And…I don't think I have anything else to say about it. |
| A-BD02 | **[#1]**  BD02: visually? It a portrait of a woman in black dress, a heavy drape behind her and it looks like when you look out the window, the drape that's thrown over the windows gives it a roman influence in term of the distance. The woman hair looks probably late 18th century and she is staring at the viewer and her eyes actually do a little bit of a following not as much as I've seen in others but, a very nice painting. |

| A-BD03 | [#1] BD03: Um, well it's a woman and she's standing in front of what looks like maybe a window or on a balcony. Um, and she's wearing black. She looks a little somber I would say. Her hair's done up in kind of curls. And, um, how much detail should we go into? [...]Well there's um in her background, there's like a Greek looking pillar, and […?] Um, what else, she like there's a lot of like attention drawn to her skin and her face because that's like the lightest part of the picture. You can see like it's kind of focused on that. The artist wants the eye of the viewer to be drawn there but, hmmm, I don't know. She looks like. I feel like that's about where I'd go with that. |
|---|---|
| A-BD04 | [#1] BD04: Um I would say, Just like what it looks like? <br> So, um, a lady who's I think she'd probably be in her 20s or maybe 30s. I can't really tell. Wearing a very puffy black dress that's off the shoulder. Um standing in front of a red curtain and a window that shows some columns that look like they're a little destroyed, and some, like a town probably farther in the distance and some trees and stuff. Yeah. |
| A-BD05 | Man 1 - Um, it looks like a Sargent. And, I don't know what do you guys think? <br> Man 2 - And it's a beautiful woman of stature with a striking face. In some kind of, with a background of a ruin of some kind. Greek, possibly? A roman arch. It's a European, it could be from a wealthy family in Europe. And she's wearing a very dark black dress. <br> Woman – Because she's in mourning. <br> Man 2 - She might be in mourning. She has a sense of loneliness. Maybe she's in mourning. Her look is intense. And it's a great really good strong feature to her face and her shoulders. <br> Woman - Because she has a burgundy curtain behind her. <br> Man 2 - Yeah the curtain is heightening. So she's standing on the edge of some villa or something. <br> Man 1 - Yeah looks Italian. |
| **GROUP B "How would you describe this to a person who is blind or low vision?"** ||
| B-AF01 | [#1] AF01: I would probably say that it is a very fair woman with an elongated face, elongated hair, curls, wearing a black dress standing in front of a curtain that looks like it's opening out to the city of Rome. She looks pretty. She looks like she's going somewhere, but she doesn't have any jewelry on so I wouldn't think she was married. At least I can't see her ring. Uhh…I don't know. Is that enough? |
| B-AF02 | **[#1]** AF02: I would describe it as having a great amount of highlight and detail on the face so you feel a very natural warmth, the features are well defined. The eyes stand out as the light reflects off of them and makes them look like they're sparkling or shimmering. There's beautiful drapery which frames the face and the shoulder area as it is not as detailed but it looks rich and heavy, like very soft if you were to touch it. There is a beautiful gauzy shawl that wraps around and helps carry your eye from the bottom left side of the body up around to the face around and back down to the far side of the image. There's some very beautiful ancient architecture, very lightly stamped in the background, behind the woman, which gives you the perception that she is in ancient Rome or Greece during a much later time, yet your eye is constantly drawn back to her face as there's the sunlight beaming on it and you can almost feel the warmth hitting her in that area. |
| B-AF03 | **[#1]** AF03: Very classical portrait-esque. The background has almost like a Greek ruins type of feel to it. Um…and the lady looks awful stern and a little bit on the bitter side. [laughter] absolutely beautiful piece though. My brother is a classically trained artist too so I really appreciate that style. And that's pretty much what I have with that one. |
| B-AF04 | **[#1]** AF04: It's a portrait of Antoine Chatelaine. It's of Lucy Dodge Allen – ah, ok – so that's the artist: Antoine. Ok. So it's a portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen about 1834 from Antoine Chatelaine. French artist. She's wearing what looks like black velvet, almost. And obviously, well-off. She has...looks like that's a wall behind her, a painted wall. That's uh – very well done. She was very attractive. It's very large. It must be 4 feet by maybe 5 feet. |

| B-AF05 | **[#1]** AF05: Uh, very dark. It's surprisingly textured for a portrait. While almost to contrast to the skin of the person in the portrait itself. Maybe to give them kind of a sense of – do you have a word for it? Just make her stand out, seem a little more elegant. Beautiful place, obviously it looks like Rome or…oh shoot, where is it? I just know it's from [unintelligible]. It's beautiful. [laughs] |
|---|---|
| B-BD01 | **[#1]** BD01: Low light. Very ah 18<sup>th</sup> century. Architectural. |
| B-BD02 | **[#1]** BD02: Um, there's a woman in a dark black dress, um with a red curtain behind her and a scene of, like, classical Roman columns and landscape behind her and the curtain. |
| B-BD03 | **[#1]** BD03:  Um, I would say portrait and half of it's draped with a cloth and the other half gives you a sort of a panoramic view into Roman or Greek rooms. The woman in the forefront is wearing a black dress and she has a hairdo like Princess Leia's [laughs]. |
| B-BD04 | **[#1]** BD04: It's a painting of a woman who is about 30 years old. From the 1800's. And her dress is a period dress. It's black and formal. And her shoulders are exposed – her skin is very creamy. And the light is exquisite in this painting and her face is long and narrow. Her hair is also a hairdo of the period. Um, it's a little poofy on the sides. And there's a backdrop of a curtain that's red. And also in the background it seems like she's either around Roman or Greek ruins. And I would describe her expression as pensive and melancholy. |
| B-BD05 | **[#1]** BD05:  To help them – we can start with a simplicity such as her hairstyle and try to describe the year it was painted so that they can get an idea of that. Um, clothing, the background, just kind of work through it in pieces and show kind of what connects and what overlays.<br>I think I would talk more about emotion. Like, how you perceive people dressed in black and her completely covered but also like, very beautiful elegant building so you know that she's at least nobility of some sort.<br>She's in a painting, you can assume that just from the painting.<br>She's also in like…describing the background, too. Being like, this – I don't know, it doesn't look like anything in particular, but it looks broken at the same time. I don't know. It just looks sad. She looks sad. |

| #2: Chandelier |
|---|



| GROUP A: How would you describe this to a friend who is not in the room? | |
|---|---|
| A-AF01 | **[#2]** AF01: A chandelier of uh…very fussy detail. Groups of grapes and cherubs and filliat-…whatever those things are filliations or something…but obviously a celebration of wine and dining…I would assume this would be over a dining table…and uhh…very interesting piece…although it's of its age…uh this was long before form followed function.. [laughter] but delightful. The cherubs are…they seem to be all the same figure, uh, in the same pose…writing things down perhaps. Hmm…very nice. |
| A-AF02 | **[#2]** AF02: An incredibly ornate chandelier, probably done not of wrought iron but of cast iron. Again this is probably somewhat later than the picture we looked at. Probably Victorian because it's so incredibly ornate. I would probably…without having read the literature, I would say that it's probably a early...no…mid to late Victorian? Probably started out as a gas lamp also…as a gas chandelier. I like my history of furniture somewhat adrift with...[laughter] |
| A-AF03 | **[#2]** AF03: Very ornate chandelier, um, and gold it looks like. Little cherubs all around it, very detailed. Looks like flowers and leaves, glass balls instead of candles, like the lights are sort of round and um..yeah very…almost like pattern very ornate… very heavy piece to me. It looks like it would weigh a million pounds. [laughter] |
| A-AF04 | **[#2]** AF04: Very ornate, large with five…glass bulbs with fruit on, cherubs, grapes, um…looks like gilded gold, um…VERY ornate, very busy so probably would've gone in a large room. Can't tell if it's electrical or it would've been candles…yeah…again very detailed. I can't tell if it's metal or yeah produced metal. Yeah, no very nice. |
| A-BD01 | **[#2]** BD01: I'd say it is a crazy baroque chandelier with cherubs sitting all the way around it. yeah! And Crystal globes, and I wonder if it's electric or not. I see metal fittings on there so possibly it's gas or was gas, or something not sure… |
| A-BD02 | **[#2]** BD02: a very ornate, almost moroka cove chandelier, with round frosted glass and etched bulbs, you can see the [inaudible] of the lights. Looks like it was either electrified afterward, yes, I think it was probably electrified after and originally held candles perhaps. Cupids on each of the brasses leading down to the two in the arms, kind of a great leaf motif and flower motif. Not my taste but they are pretty. |

| A-BD03 | [#2] BD03: I would say it's very like intricate gold and like floral or like natural designs. And they all like work together kind of...it's a very natural looking chandelier. Yeah of course there's also like some cherubs, er cherubs and some grapes, and I mean I guess it might be noted the cherubs are a different color. They're not so golden, they're more like oxidized looking. And up top here's some vases? I don't even know what those are. They look like vases I think. And those are also oxidized so they add a bit of contrast to the chandelier. And then the circular lamps. There [laughs]. Try to be concise. |
|---|---|
| A-BD04 | [#2] BD04: Well, a chandelier that is mostly kind of a matte gold, not necessarily super shiny. With 6 um bulbs that have like a design on them. Some parts are clear some are matted out. Um and then some darker figures like little boys it looks like. Kind of a dark brown almost black color. Lots of like um leaves it looks like and grapes I think at the very bottom, and flowers. Yeah. |
| A-BD05 | Man 2 - A very gaudy looking, um, chandelier with cherubs. Ah what are they doing, they are writing something. Maybe they're muses? Who knows, they're writing something. They're all writing something. And ah I don't know. Ah, hanging fruits at the bottom. All gold colored, gold leafed? I don't know. Um, very, way too busy for my taste. Rococo? I don't know, it's ugly. Woman - Elaborate. Man 2 – Sorry. INT: Hey it's say what you see, and that's what you see! Man 2 - It almost looks like a sugar cone there. Man 1 - And since we're in Salem Massachusetts and it's been snowing, these look like icicles. INT: Context association there. Man 1 - Those are actually grape leaves. Man 2 - The reference is complete over-the-top abundance. Just sheer abundance with fruit and but it is I think they've got writing quills and so it's significant to somebody who's educated and writing. Woman - I like the fact that they have some black color in the kids, the little figures… Man 1 - It's a whole grape scene so I think ah maybe Bacchus? Man 2 - It's all about drinking wine and being rich. [Laughs] |
| **GROUP B "How would you describe this to a person who is blind or low vision?"** | |
| B-AF01 | [#2] AF01: Super ornate French uhh, candelabra with some little, whatever you call those kind of people, oohh I don't know what they're called, but they're sitting around it. Super French and ornate [whisper from the Gallery… "cherubs"] huh? Cherubs that's what they are. The little Cherubs. It hangs with grapes, grapes seems to be the theme throughout…that I can see. It's about three feet tall, and it spans probably about two to two and a half feet. It would have to go in a very big room if you were to put it in one, and it has six globes and it also has some cherubs or some black up top, but I can't see that far, with my visual distance, sorry cataracts. |
| B-AF02 | [#2] AF02: This beautiful light fixture actually has lots of delicate leaves finely carved into it as well as some flowers. You can see a beautiful bunch of grapes round in each little piece that hangs from the bottom. It's gilded with some rich gold, if you were to touch this piece you could almost feel every nook and cranny. There are clear and white frosted globes around each light. There are six total, evenly spaced. So it's a beautiful chandelier, and there are some great ivory or ebony-looking figures…holding feathered pens. Cherubs. Little children, they look soft and gentle looking like they're very busy scrolling away at the very top of the piece near the ceiling are some beautiful morning glory trumpet type flowers draping down ever so daintily with some roses kind of cascading around in a nice little swag. And below that are three or four dark ebony faces that look like Bacchus from the Greek times, the god of grapes and they are again enrobed and wrapped by these beautiful grape leaves, and it looks very natural, very...very complex, and your eye just moves all around it because there's so much movement with the various swirls and upward lifting of the various branches. |

| B-AF03 | [#2] AF03: I would describe it as very vibrant and intricate. This type of work would have to take the artist a very, very long painstaking time. The flowers, the cherubs and all the detail…Um…almost a lot of subtle images too, hidden. It's just the, you can almost feel it, it's so intricate. That's it. |
|---|---|
| B-AF04 | **[#2]** AF04: It's a very large chandelier. Blue. Um, it's a _____ I don't know if it is…gilded…very ornate. With uh one, two, three…six round bulbs for the lights. It's about 4 ½ feet high and 3 feet wide. It has six arms. Very ornate, a lot of carving. Cherubs in the middle. I'd say it was probably built when there was gas, so it's probably 19<sup>th</sup> century or around there. Or it could be 18<sup>th</sup>…late 18<sup>th</sup>. |
| B-AF05 | **[#2]** AF05: It seems very intricate. Very organic shapes, floral designs, and golden textures, and gold. With lots of candles and a darker metal, which is surprising based on the subject matter. And has etched glass continuing the theme of organic shapes and fruits. |
| B-BD01 | **[#2]** BD01: I would describe it as ornate. Baroque. Gilded, with the black onyx cherubs, with profuse carving. |
| B-BD02 | **[#2]** BD02: …It's a large, golden chandelier with cherubs in a darker metal, and a lot of the chandelier looks like it's made to kinda look like it's made of leaves and, um, flowers it looks like, and has, um yeah. |
| B-BD03 | **[#2]** BD03: It's very thorny(?), gold and bronzy. A chandelier with like 6 frosted round globes, and looks like there's a cherub perched above each globe and it's in a darker material [inaudible] with filial with like fruit leaves and flowers and [laughs] I don't know if that would give a good impression, but… |
| B-BD04 | **[#2]** BD04: I would describe this as a low-hanging chandelier with…I don't think you call this filigree but it's gold leaf, vines, and leaves. And there are six orbs which form the lighting of the chandelier – they are equidistant from each other as they come up from the bottom. And the orbs have etchings on them so that some of the – I guess you would call that frosted gold - the etchings have, what do you call them, orbs? Not orbs, they're spheres? Not spheres. Um the opals, they're not circles, they're ovals. And the leaves, the greenery that is gold-plated is very intricate so you see a lot of different leaves and it has flowers in it, too. At the top, above the orbs, there are angels. There are six angels and they look like they're maybe bronzed. There are grapes at the top. It's fixed to the ceiling. |
| B-BD05 | **[#2]** BD05: [laugh] Yeah, definitely go with that. Like, if they know what Rococo is – just, that's it. [laughs] Just because, I mean, it definitely screams out like French era ornateness with like the gold, the little like gold leaf and the cupids and um [sighs] oh damn, this is ornate.<br>INT: Anything else?<br>BD05: I don't really know how you would describe something like this other than like, describing in immense detail and being like, well – there's ivy, and plants, and flowers, and grapes hanging from the bottom but there's also flowers growing from the top. It would be hard. It would be like something you have to like, touch since it's a feeling.<br>INT: You feel like you wanna touch it.<br>BD05: Yeah [indistinguishable] you would cut your hand real easy.<br>I don't know how I would describe that.<br>Rococo. |

| GROUP A: How would you describe this to a friend who is not in the room? | |
|---|---|
| A-AF01 | **[#3]** AF01: It seems to be a portrait of some kind of a tattoo or some kind of a military presentation. Surrounded by trees of amazing similarity…almost wonder if a few of these were a natural formation or planted to create the effect. Very formal attire on everybody, and obviously of its age..ahh…it doesn't seem to be any kind of conflict or war going on, it's more of a show parade for celebration, it would seem to me. Yeah… |
| A-AF02 | [#3] AF02: Ok…probably it's a historic description, umm looks like a training field with soldiers out marching around…um, very symmetrical, surprisingly symmetrical. Obviously they're trying to commemorate some event, and would, judging from the training field without looking at the particulars, it probably might even be something from the civil war…possibly 1812…not Civil War…Revolutionary War, probably depicting some sort of event. Again quite large…it was probably commissioned, from maybe just before the Civil War..That is I guess how I would describe that. |
| A-AF03 | **[#3]** AF03: Ok large painting, um, of looks like, I mean, a day and…oh, let me look and see what they're doing, so it says a training day, so I guess is that military? Military out on a field? yeah… military lined up on a field, lots of trees surrounding like a square kind of squared off area in what looks like a town so almost like a courtyard type thing in the middle of a town, you've got people milling around up front, walking past, on horses, on carriages, um yeah, just kind of like a not super high view but like you're looking down, almost as if you're like across the street like on a porch or something looking down over, but not too high…in the distance…they're all lined up like they're…let me see what it says, British…no I'm looking at the wrong thing…Salem Common on training day, ok, yeah they're obviously training the military [laughter] that's all I got. |
| A-AF04 | **[#3]** AF04: It looks like a parade or a march, so either a busy occasion or a day at the races. Um…Lots of I don't know what kind of trees they are over here, but we would call them Leylandii trees just lining the streets. There's a green square that looks like it's got a…I don't know if they're going to battle or if it's a reenactment of a battle, it looks like two armies against each other and there's a white… surrounded by a white fence, but the foreground looks like a day out for people, so I presume it's a cheery day as opposed to anything too serious. Yeah.. |
| A-BD01 | **[#3]** BD01: I'd say that it is a landscape, something like the Lexington battle green or something like that, soldiers in formation and very strange perspective on the trees which rise to an arch in the middle one only knows why that might be. It is a little bit more primitive of course than the portrait back there that's it. |

| | |
|---|---|
| A-BD02 | **[#3]** BD02: first, it appears to be a painting of a lot of trees, looks little European and terms of the shapes of the trees I don't know what that name of that tree is called but you see it all over France but it's also set at a park. First it looks like a race track but it must be a park with some horning's probably the precursors of little street vendors' booths and people in the foreground. Focus's really on the trees, on the parade ground or something, the background with more building but you can't really see those. Looks like a Saturday or Sunday afternoon in a large town or small city. |
| A-BD03 | **[#3]** BD03: So it looks like um well obviously there are a bunch of trees and they're all kind of mirrored across, but getting smaller in the distance. And beneath the trees there's like a little parade or like ah things going on in town. And some, in the center it looks like kind of like a battle green, like I'm from Lexington so it looks like the battle green of Lexington a bit. Reminds me of that. And maybe they're doing either like a reenactment or um some, they're in formation to do something. But it doesn't necessarily look violent because there's people around with kids, horses and a market, exactly. And it looks like it's maybe like sundown or something. Doesn't look like midday. So, that's my description I guess. |
| A-BD04 | [#3] BD04: So, it looks like there's a festival going on of some sort or a big gathering. And um I think there's some troops lined up in the middle of a grass field with a white fence around it. And there's a lot of trees lined up and they look like the tallest are in the middle and they slowly get shorter as they go to the outside with their long or tall straight trees. Some clouds in the sky and a few white tents outside of the fence. Just looks like a lot of families walking around. There's a few dogs and some horses and, well it looks like an old fashioned wheel barrel. Yeah. |
| A-BD05 | Man 2 - Ah, high society horse race, horse carriage racing. It looks European cause of the trees, but it could be the US I'm not sure. <br> Woman - Um maybe we're having a military exercise and people are watching it. <br> Man 2 - So some parade. Yes, you're right. It's a big parade, and it looks like they're going to race around the outside. Looks like there's a race track. So there's probably heavy betting, some more drinking going on. And um, some parade, so it's a celebration of some commemorative of some war. <br> Man 1 - It's the Salem Common… <br> Woman - No don't read, don't read! Don't forget about the trees… <br> Man 2 - We'll the trees look European… <br> Woman – First thing you see is the trees. <br> Man 2 - They look European to me, but it's obviously not. It's very early, I would say early 1800's… It looks very symmetrical. And the crowd is there. So this is the Common? Interesting. |
| **GROUP B "How would you describe this to a person who is blind or low vision?"** | |
| B-AF01 | [#3] AF01: It's almost like a panoramic that you're coming…here's the camera and this is a straight street, but because you're getting a panoramic view of it, it looks bent. You know what I'm saying? Lots of trees, lots of trees, lots of trees. There's a town behind it. They're battling. I don't know if they're practicing, but I would think so because people are just standing around watching. Horses, kids…and the trees surround the battle. And on the other side it looks like there's a town and there's horses and parks and people who look like they're selling goods at the bottom, but I think most of them came to see the fighting that's going on. |

| | |
|---|---|
| B-AF02 | **[#3]** AF02: This is a fairly large piece. It's very linear. There are very tall trees that look like they've been pruned and groomed into almost a cone or teardrop shape. There's no foliage towards the bottom. These trees are the biggest part of the image as they go from right to left completely in the center of the image. They're highlighted at the top with the warmth of a sun setting and you can almost feel it as that's what's at the very tips of the trees and it fades into a beautiful blue cool upper sky with some fluffy clouds and very tiny little birds in the very far background, just barely visual at the very bottom which your eye keeps getting drawn to because it's heavy, there's a beautiful dirt road with some canopies where you can see some vendors. There are lots of people, there's women in long dresses and men in their pantsuits. You can certainly tell that it's from a much later time period than some of the images as the style of the clothing- they're wearing bonnets that have big brims on the women and taller hats on the men. It's an interesting mix, there's several people dressed in white which is kind of unusual and carries your eye around. Directly behind that, just behind the trees, you can see rows and rows of soldiers, some dressed in dark blue and right in the center there seems to be a group of men soldiers who are dressed in red. They seem to be practicing for some kind of a battle or some kind of a marching in some celebration. Directly in front of them is where we have a group of people standing by and watching. They're almost indecipherable as individuals because the detail is not as rich. Again in the foreground you can see the great detail of the people walking around. Your eye moves from right to left as the white becomes bigger and bigger and you can see the market scene. There are horses and a couple of people pushing buggies and a couple of horses pulling carriages. It makes you feel like this is a celebration time somewhere in the vicinity of a military or government building as well as just a marketplace. Is that good? |
| B-AF03 | [#3] AF03: Very…um…hmm. I get the artist was kind of focusing on almost the feel of the land and the season almost, like, kinda like he was projecting like, you could almost smell what kind of trees there were, you could feel the temperature. It seems to me that…he…almost like there are two different styles, like, the trees look very impressionistic and the people are more intricately painted, but when I see this painting I'm more drawn to the trees and like the season and the smell and the feel of the air and everything. That's what I get from that. |
| B-AF04 | **[#3]**AF04: Salem Common Training Day. Ok so it's roughly 1800- 1808. It's the military training in Salem Commons, Salem Mass. It's a large field surrounded by tall trees and there are some horse drawn carriages, some people working with wheelbarrows, a lot of spectators. There are various tents along the outside of the fence and I assume they're vendors. And uh, the watching and practicing area is fenced in. Again, it's large. It must 4 ½ feet by 3 ½. It's nice. |
| B-AF05 | **[#3]** AF05: I don't know if symmetrical can really apply [laughs] very symmetrical, um…forest-esque. Actually, very busy surprisingly, because it's depicting what looks like an average scene – yeah, average colonial scene. Um, not very high in contrast –oh, gosh they're blind. Um. [laughs] Very muted color palette. Sunset or sunrise. [unintelligible] |
| B-BD01 | **[#3]** BD01: It appears to be a scene at a parade ground with well-manicured trees, carriages, horses. And it appears to be done almost in, like, a perspective. |
| B-BD02 | **[#3]** BD02: …So it's like a outdoor scene. There are a bunch of tall pine trees it looks like, um, stretching across the middle of the painting and it's a scene of like, um, horsetrack or something. There's a bunch of horses with like drawing carriages behind them, and people walking around, I guess. |

| | |
|---|---|
| B-BD03 | **[#3]** BD03: Ok, um it looks like there's 2 armies lined up on a big field and, ah, there's a fence in front and it almost looks like there's spectators, um, on the other side of the fence. And the trees are very stylized. Um look like arborvitae type trees that come to a peak in the center and almost a third of the canvas is sky and clouds. Nice kind of sunset like colors [laughs]. |
| B-BD04 | **[#3]** BD04: This looks like a field where there are military maneuvers and because of the horse carriages and the attire of the people, it looks like something from the 1800's but I could be wrong. And then there are trees surrounding this field but they're not ordinary trees. At the top they look like poplars and they have a long…trunk, the trunk is very long and then you can see a tree that looks like a poplar on top so I don't know what this is native of because I've never seen a tree like this. It's a sunny day but it looks like it's at the end of the day like maybe dusk because there's pink in the background and it's variably cloudy. It's not sunny, it's not cloudy. I guess they call that partly cloudy but it's more sun than clouds. And it's definitely the end of the day. There's a lot of horses and carriages outside the field where there's those military maneuvers. And there's buildings on the other side of the field and they're drawn to scale. |
| B-BD05 | **[#3]** BD05: It's definitely an event, like a world fair of some sorts but then there's also a war going on in the background so it might just be kind of like a struggle depiction of the times and like showing what was happening and like the war…it looks like there's women's suffrage in the middle ground and like then they have like a fair in the foreground where there's like the horses and the carriages and there's a lot of people and a lot of trees for some reason. Like potentially, it's a separated event in time but also it could just be like to show maybe how people are not really paying attention to what's happening beyond the fence, beyond the line. INT: M-hm. BD05: I'd describe it as really dense. Like the top is so empty and heavy in its own way but the middle is so dense that it's almost um, not necessarily nauseating but it's like um…vibrating, in a way that it like hurts your eyes. In the middle especially, off the orange it like vibrates. Um but it's really just like overpopulated. Like, there really isn't really necessarily, I mean there's a bit of composition but like it's not that it's just so heavy at the bottom but like it's so dense. I don't know how they painted that painting. [laughs] |

## II.    Follow-Up Interview

1.    What did you think of that experience of describing what you see?

| GROUP A | |
| --- | --- |
| A-AF01 | **[Q1]** AF01: I don't know if I have the background or expertise to really say anything but my personal taste about these things, and uh happy to share it, but not in any sense of "you're going to learn something here from me", but umm…I've been coming to this museum for probably fifty years…used to be a member when I had an office on Front Street, and I'd come over here. I've seen a lot of changes in the place, some that I like and some that I don't like. |
| A-AF02 | **[Q1]** AF02: Um, basically it's more of just a mind reflecting what I'm thinking through in my mind, I like my history so I've tried to be observant about it |
| A-AF03 | **[Q1]** AF03: It's actually harder to describe something when somebody's recording you… I guess you think about what you're saying, but I probably would have…I don't know.  It's just kinda hard to explain it as if somebody's not in the room, you just think, "just look at it!", but you can't say that so [laughter] |
| A-AF04 | **[Q1]** AF04: Difficult. Yeah. Because you kind of make your own opinions of it and then you kind of walk away. You don't take it in as much to have to describe it. So yeah, it makes you look at it a lot more than you probably would have done normally. Yeah. |
| A-BD01 | **[Q1]** BD01: That felt like an art test! it is very strange<br>I kind of wondered mostly what the questions were for. |
| A-BD02 | **[Q1]** BD02: it was fine, it's kind of what I would do but when I look at any pictures except I spoke out loud instead of to myself. |
| A-BD03 | **[Q1]** BD03: um I think it's definitely good to practice describing what you see versus what you think you see. So that's important. And it's sometimes brings you second awareness that you're imposing a lot of what you have, whatever you bring to the table you kind of impose upon a painting. But it's also good to try and leave it a little open-ended so if you're describing to someone you want them to interpret it in whatever way they see it. So, I thought that was, it was good experience. A little broadening of your horizons. |
| A-BD04 | [Q1] BD04: I think it made me look at it more than I probably normally would and maybe I'll remember it a little bit better. Um, I don't think someone could tell exactly what I was looking at by what I said, cause there's so much in each painting, but definitely I think it made me look harder at what I was seeing. Come up with words to describe it. |
| A-BD05 | Woman - It makes you zone in more closely.<br>Man 2 – More observant, yeah.<br>INT: You have a special knack for it I think.<br>Man 2 - Only when I pay attention, otherwise I'm in my zombie zone. I rarely pay attention, so it feels good to focus.<br>Woman – so what's the purpose of this? |
| **GROUP B** | |
| B-AF01 | AF01: Oh I didn't have any problem. I can talk to you about anything. Other people I think it would be more difficult. But, I've been to museums all over the world so it's kinda…I've seen everything pretty much, that I want to see, and if I haven't seen it I pretty much don't want to see it. If it makes sense. So…yeah. |

| | |
|---|---|
| B-AF02 | **[Q1]** AF02: I think that it actually made me more aware of what I was processing as I looked at each piece, like it actually made me take a closer look and spend more time really figuring out the words that I was feeling but didn't really have in the front of my head so that was kinda a nice thing to be able to do. I think it made me appreciate it more. |
| B-AF03 | **[Q1]** AF03: The experience...? Fun! It refreshes my brain on my art history courses and things that I've learned. I've grown up around artists…so…I love to talk about art and uh you know, it's you know art is like an element almost you know. It can do things, and everybody views or feels it differently. Like that piece could bring absolute dread to someone, and it could also be like background filler to another person, and another person it could be so beautiful it brings tears to their eyes, you know? I'm a musician so I can appreciate all the different influences and perspectives it brings to other people. So… |
| B-AF04 | **[Q1]** AF04: Well it was brand new for me, so um. Well I think it was a way to get you involved and think about what you're seeing in detail. I think it was good, all around. A good thing to do. Not something you would do if you wouldn't have asked. Me –I can only speak for me. |
| B-AF05 | **[Q1]** AF05: Um, I feel very limited in my ability to explain art to blind people. [laughs] But it's good to know that you're looking for ways to branch out to explain, you know, things they can't see. Unfortunately they can't touch it. |
| B-BD01 | **[Q1]** BD01: Fun! |
| B-BD02 | **[Q1]** BD02: It was really hard.<br>INT: It was really hard.<br>BD02:..Yeah. I, it was hard to think of ways to describe like the shape of a pine tree and I wasn't totally sure what was going on around the track.<br>INT: Um, hmm. And just being…<br>BD02: Yeah.<br>INT: … thrown in was hard to do it?<br>BD02: Yeah. |
| B-BD03 | **[Q1]** BD03: Um, it was easier than I thought it would be, I guess [laughs]. |
| B-BD04 | **[Q1]** BD04: I think I would have liked to look at it for a longer period of time to think about it. And um, but just off the top of my head, I think you have to have good descriptive skills which I'm not sure I have but I tried to do the best I could. But I think if people have more time to look at it and then they gave you a description then it might be easier.<br>INT:  You felt just, on the spot…<br>BD04: Well it's on the spot, it's extemporaneous, it's probably not as good a job as if you would do if you had time to think about it or to write it down first of all, maybe write a paragraph on it and then correct what you wrote (I used to be a teacher) and then edit what you wrote and then practice it. |
| B-BD05 | **[Q1]** BD05: Well we're both art students so I kind of, I said a lot. It's a little bit more specific than when you're trying to explain to someone, you definitely have to think a little bit harder and think about how you would – I mean cuz like you see it differently and you notice things but you have to be able to like explain it in a way that is like, that they can see it. I can think of like a better way to say it other than that because they obviously can't see. So you would be standing there you would have to not only describe the objects but like, what she did was like describing emotion and like showing in a way that they could like easily visualize it in their head. And like talk about the colors, the mood, and the setting and everything like that. |

2a. The museum is working on a project where visitors will be able to record audio descriptions and share with other visitors.  On a scale of 1 to 10, with 1 being not at all interested, and 10 being very interested), how interested do you think you would be in **contributing** to something like that? (Follow up: can you tell me more about your rating?)

| Not at all | | | | | | | | | Very |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |

| GROUP A | |
|---|---|
| A-AF01 | **[Q2a] AF01:** 5 or 6?<br>INT: What makes you say that?<br>AF01: I'm on Facebook, and I thought I was having a conversation with one of my friends, and it was actually posted. I…I…<br>INT: Ahh privacy issues?<br>AF01: Yeah, you know I don't feel that empowered to share my view of stuff rather than what I see rather than trying to break things down and say this is from this…yeah I don't get any of that stuff, but uh… and the other one that was here was the sculptor…the kiss…you know |
| A-AF02 | **[Q2a] AF02:** I would consider it…I like the background of a lot of things…so I suppose my approach would be somewhat more technical than…what do I say…emotional perhaps. Relying more on …what do I say…the hard facts of history as opposed to just impressions of history, but that's something that I would probably consider and actually…having just entered retirement, I'm sort of trying to do that in my hometown, which is my New Hampshire town trapped in Massachusetts, namely Salisbury. And it is…you cross that Merrimack River and something changes in people's heads…OK?<br>**INT:** Yup…If you had to give a number to it, where do you think it might fall on the scale?<br>**[Q2a]** cont. I'm going to say…just because I've lost a lot of my structure entering retirement, I'm interested but not overly…I'd say maybe a 6 or 7…tending towards interested but I try to stay interested in everything |
| A-AF03 | **[Q2a]** AF03: Um...contributing to…just uh I guess yeah, I mean a 9 or a 10 if somebody can't [see]…yeah, I mean it's a good idea. |
| A-AF04 | **[Q2a] AF04**: oooh. No. Well, I hate the sound of my voice anyway so no, it's completely out of my comfort zone. I'm from the U.K., we don't do that. [laughter]<br>[INT: So like a low number like…]<br>**AF04:** Yeah probably like a 3 or something. |
| A-BD01 | BD01: Very interested!<br>BDO1: Let make it a 9. |
| A-BD02 | BD02:  after  knowing more about what the purpose was, I don't know very much about art  and so I would be reluctant  to spend my time explaining to somebody else something that I didn't fully  understand myself<br>INT: so knowing, not knowing the purpose from 1 to 10 how interested would you be? Less inclined or…<br>BDO2: Less inclined, not knowing the purpose.<br>INT: maybe like a 5?<br>BD02: 3 |

| A-BD03 | [Q2a] BD03: Yeah, I wouldn't see anything bad about it, as long as it's not like too much of a time commitment, for the average person. But I think it's a really nice concept to have people that aren't necessarily like visually capable of seeing the art to experience it too. That's important.<br>INT: So from 1 to 10 for adding a contribution, where do you think you'd fall in the 1 being not at all, and 10 being very.<br>BD03: Like 7. |
|---|---|
| A-BD04 | [Q2a] BD04: Probably not super interested because I think it's like each visit is like, you should be able to think what you're thinking about each thing. It's a very personal thing when you're looking at things, and then you read the little descriptions usually, but I don't.<br>INT: So would you fall more in the<br>BD04: In that area probably like a 3. |
| A-BD05 | Woman – 9 and a half.<br>Man 2 – In what though? I don't know what I'm interested in.<br>INT: In recording a description like that for other visitors.<br>Man 2 – Oh, doing what you're doing?<br>Man 1 – She's just trying to gather information.<br>Man 2 – Well I think museums are incredible resources. This is kind of an expensive one to get into for the general population. For middle class like me. So if I could get in for free, I'd do it.<br>INT: Oh for the perks?<br>Man 2 – Yeah. How's that for an honest answer?<br>INT: So 1 to 10, with no perks potentially added.<br>Man 2 – 8. |
| **Group B** | |
| B-AF01 | AF01: 10!<br>INT: And what makes you say 10?<br>[Q2a] AF01: Well, I'm a potter and I've done pottery for 14 years. I've travelled the world and seen other pieces and described them to friends or talked to them about them with friends who are miseducated or weren't as well travelled…I mean you can go see a Picasso in almost every museum all over the world…but which Picasso are you seeing…on of his great ones or one of his dumb things…um I'm a big talker...usually I can just keep going. Keep going. But that's just my opinion, I don't know anything about the painting, but I could talk to you about it describing it. |
| B-AF02 | [Q2a] AF02: I would probably be somewhere around an 8. Because I enjoy doing these types of things and I think it's really important to be able to share those experiences with others. |
| B-AF03 | [Q2a] AF03: I'd be very interested. 10. Definitely.<br>INT: And why 10? Do you think?<br>[Q2a]-I could ramble on about art. It's what separates us from animals, I think, the ability to express ourselves. And without art, it's very black and grey out there, so it's very important to me. |
| B-AF04 | [Q2a] AF04: I'd say a 5.<br>INT: And what made you say 5?<br>AF04: I think it's a good thing, I think it actually is a good thing to do. I'm just not so sure I feel good about doing it myself personally. That's all. I don't know if I'd be up to it. |
| B-AF05 | [Q2a] AF05: 10? I'd say 8 to 10 range. They could get a good laugh out of some of my descriptions. [laughs] |
| B-BD01 | INT: Recording an audio description like that for another person.<br>BD01: An 8.<br>INT: And why do you say an 8?<br>BD01: I don't know. |

| B-BD02 | **[Q2a]** BD02: 1 (laughs) |
| --- | --- |
| | INT: A 1. |
| | BD02: Yeah. |
| | INT: And tell me more about your 1 |
| | BD02: Um, I'd rather look at a painting myself and interpret it myself than have someone do it for me I think. |
| | INT: And you specifically contributing it, is that, would you not want to do that? The actual recording of the audio description? |
| | BD02: Yeah, I just hate hearing my own voice on audio, that's why. |
| | INT: Ok. |
| B-BD03 | **[Q2a]** BD03: Um, I don't know. I'm kind of busy, so I would guess I would say…. |
| | INT: Well, just theoretically, if it was an option in a museum experience, what do you think it would be? |
| | BD03: Maybe around 5 from 1 to 10. |
| B-BD04 | **[Q2a]** BD04: I'd be interested. |
| | INT: 1 to 10? |
| | BD04: Maybe 9. If it was something I could understand. With some art, I don't really know. Something like this is easy because anyone can figure it out. |
| | INT: On the flip side of that, would you be interested in listening to others? How interested from 1 to 10? |
| B-BD05 | **[Q2a]** BD05: Probably like a 4 because I'm not very good at it and I feel like you need somebody who's like well-spoken but can like describe something with perfect detail versus like mumbo-jumbo. I think it'd be more of like a lot practice, so for me it would be a 4. |
| | The idea itself is definitely like high up there, an 8 or a 9 or something like that, because it would be great if people could come in and just listen especially people that are not even blind just like visually impaired or like don't know a lot it about it – yeah, color blind. Um like, and having citizens do it is a lot less droning than like just picking one voice that goes on because then you'd have a bunch of different voices and then you'd have it's almost like a shared community. But I'd also probably be like right around in the middle just because I'd probably go off on a tangent. [laughs] So in the middle maybe 5 or 6. |

2b. On the same scale of 1-10, how interested would you be in **listening** to *other* visitors' audio descriptions? (Follow up: can you tell me more about your rating?)

| Not at all | | | | | | | | | Very |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |

| Group A | |
|---|---|
| A-AF01 | **[Q2b]** AF1: Umm, if they had some insight…yes. But if they were just like me…sharing the joy of watching or seeing something without really…uh yeah I don't know…I get so much from looking at the picture, that it would take things away from it to have somebody try to explain it me that didn't know what they were talking about… <br> INT: So maybe similarly a 5 or a 6, or less on the scale? <br> AF01: Probably less on the scale. Yeahh.. But if I had a curator like yourself, saying "did you notice this over here", than probably a lot more so, yeah.. <br> INT: That kind of content you'd be more interested in… <br> AF01: Yeah.. |
| A-AF02 | **[Q2b]** AF02: Probably less interested. [INT: Less? Why do you say that?] Something I learned way back in high school is to always consider the source and I, you know…and trying to do that…and approaching geezerdom also…my credibility of source is going down… because …so let's say a 4. But you're never going to get a 1 and you're never going to get a 10 out of me. I'm trying to be a good Yankee. |
| A-AF03 | **[Q2b]** AF03: Hmmm maybe like a 6 or a 7…yea. [INT: And why do you say a 6 or 7?] Just because…it depends on…I mean wouldn't say 9 or 10 because some people may go on and on and on, might get a little bit wordy. But it would be interesting, especially after I've done it to see what other people say. Like to compare it, I guess, that would make it…that's why I would be interested. |
| A-AF04 | **[Q2b]** AF04: Yeah, that's different. Probably a bit higher, maybe a 7 or an 8. Just to see…compare. I'd like to do it whilst looking at it as well though if that makes sense? Without just listening and picturing it myself…yeah I'd like to see what other people kind of get out of it that I've missed maybe, so yeah, that would be higher than the doing it myself. Yeah definitely. |
| A-BD01 | **[Q2b]** BD01: That would all depend on the quality of the first recording I listened to. If the person was articulate and had interesting things to say I would probably listen to every single one of them but I'm one of the people who go around and reads every single little plaque. <br> INT: You are a reader? <br> BD01: Yeah! And I do like those recordings too. <br> INT: So if you had the option to listen to an assortment of contributions, on a 1 to 10 scale, of sort of taking the leap of depending on the quality or not, how interested would you be in trying it out? <br> BDO1: trying out what? <br> INT: listening to the descriptions. <br> BD01: I would definitely listen to it right away if it was available. <br> INT: would you say you would fall around a 9 as well? <br> BD01: If it was available it would be a 10. If there was a button to push I would push it. |
| A-BD02 | **[Q2b]** BDO2: 7-8 … again I want them to be informative as supposed to just their reactions. I would rather know from somebody who knows about it. |

| A-BD03 | **[Q2b]** BD03: I'd probably be more like a like 5 or 4. Just cause like I like to interpret it myself too. But it's a nice idea, I mean for other people who want that. |
|---|---|
| A-BD04 | **[Q2b]** BD04: Probably not very interested, like 3 again.<br>INT: Um and uh why is that do you think?<br>BD04: Prefer like thinking things myself. I mean if I was with other people I might hear what they want to say, but I wouldn't go out of my way to go listen. |
| A-BD05 | Woman – Depends on how articulate they are, right?<br>Man 2 – 8. |
| **Group B** | |
| B-AF01 | **[Q2b]** AF1: I think that might be helpful as being a describer. I think YOU could help them as being a describer. Because I'm sure there are things that I don't think about that blind people would need, that people who teach and work with the blind could come in and say, "this is what you need to be talking and saying, these are things that are going to get them most interested in the picture", you know, things like that. I mean, especially if they're blind and have never seen the light of day, you know, color, if I say green that's not going to mean shit. You know? I can say, it's brighter/lighter, you know, there's animals around, but you can't really describe colors to a blind person. I mean maybe if there are some people with some vision, like peripheral or something...they see colors. But yeah, I think it would be good for both people to talk about their stories and see if they can't improve upon them...saying it to a blind person. |
| B-AF02 | **[Q2b]** AF02: I would put that somewhere between a 6 and a 7, because I would definitely enjoy that but at the same time I oftentimes just enjoy the reading and looking myself, so. It would be interesting just to hear what other people see that I might miss. |
| B-AF03 | **[Q2b]** AF03: Higher...probably like an 8. |
| B-AF04 | **[Q2b]** AF04: That would be uh...I'd say 8-9.<br>INT: 8-9?<br>AF04: Yeah, yeah. I like to hear how other people feel. Um, yeah. I'm just thinking of myself. As a speaker, I'm not that good at it, that's why. But uh sure, why not? It's good to know that the average person thinks, because I'm one of them. |
| B-AF05 | **[Q2b]** AF05:  More of a 6 or a 7. I'd keep the 8 to 10 range.<br>INT: Why do you say 6 or 7?<br>AF05: I'm more of a visual person. |
| B-BD01 | **[Q2b]** BD1:  5.<br>INT: Can you tell me a little more about your rating of 5 for the listening question?<br>BD01: Um, I'm more clearly interested in my own perceptions and, perspectives, and um…<br>INT: …Than others?<br>BD01: Yeah. |
| B-BD02 | **[Q2b]** BD1:  I think if they knew something about art I'd be interested, but I don't know anything about art so, but if it was someone like someone who was like an art student at UNH or something that'd be cool but…<br>INT: Yeah, so sort of your 1-10 varies on who the person is?<br>BD1:  Yeah, definitely. |

| | |
|---|---|
| B-BD03 | **[Q2b]** BD03: Um, maybe about the same.<br>INT: Still a 5?  And um, why do you think you'd fall into a 5 for [inaudible]<br>BD03: Um, maybe just cause I'm able to just look [laughs].<br>INT: You prefer just to do that?<br>BD03: Yeah, I guess so. |
| B-BD04 | **[Q2b]** BD04:  But how would I get the - would I actually have to come in to listen to it?<br>INT: Like, say it was on your phone or –<br>BD04: Yeah, I'd be interested.<br>INT: So 1 to 10?<br>BD04: Yeah, I'm a retired person.<br>INT: [laughs] Yeah, so you would? So if 1 was not at all and 10 was very, where do you think you'd fall?<br>BD04: 9.<br>INT: 9 again? |
| B-BD05 | **[Q2b]** BD05:  Definitely a 7. That'd be really interesting to listen to. Like if you had like multiple people describing it, because people do describe everything so differently, it's be interesting to hear like other people's opinions on what this – specifically this one – like what's going on right there? So, that'd be nice. |

# Please tell us more about you…

**Is this your first time at Peabody Essex Museum?**

☐ Yes ☐ No

| First Time Visitor | Frequency | % |
|---|---|---|
| Yes | 5 | 26 |
| No | 14 | 74 |

| Visitor ID | First Time |
|---|---|
| A_AF01 | No |
| A_AF02 | No |
| A_AF03 | Yes |
| A_AF04 | Yes |
| A_BD01 | No |
| A_BD02 | No |
| A_BD03 | No |
| A_BD04 | Yes |
| A_BD05 | No |
| B_AF01 | No |
| B_AF02 | Yes |
| B_AF03 | Yes |
| B_AF04 | No |
| B_AF05 | No |
| B_BD01 | No |
| B_BD02 | No |
| B_BD03 | No |
| B_BD04 | No |
| B_BD05 | No |

**What is your age range?**

☐ 18-24 ☐ 25-34 ☐ 35-44 ☐ 45-54 ☐ 55-64 ☐ 65 or older

| Age Range | Frequency | % |
|---|---|---|
| 18-24 | 5 | 26 |
| 25-34 | 2 | 11 |
| 35-44 | 2 | 11 |
| 55-64 | 5 | 26 |

| Visitor ID | Age Range |
|---|---|
| A_AF01 | 65 or older |

| | |
|---|---|
| A_AF02 | 65 or older |
| A_AF03 | 25-34 |
| A_AF04 | 35-44 |
| A_BD01 | 45-54 |
| A_BD02 | 55-64 |
| A_BD03 | 18-24 |
| A_BD04 | 18-24 |
| A_BD05 | 55-64 |
| B_AF01 | 55-64 |
| B_AF02 | 35-44 |
| B_AF03 | 25-34 |
| B_AF04 | 65 or older |
| B_AF05 | 18-24 |
| B_BD01 | 55-64 |
| B_BD02 | 18-24 |
| B_BD03 | 55-64 |
| B_BD04 | 65 or older |
| B_BD05 | 18-24 |

## What is your Occupation? _____

| Visitor ID | Occupation |
|---|---|
| A_AF01 | Retired - financial services |
| A_AF02 | Retired - real estate / construction manager |
| A_AF03 | Marketing manager |
| A_AF04 | Administration - Offices |
| A_BD01 | Writer |
| A_BD02 | Educational administration |
| A_BD03 | Student |
| A_BD04 | Student |
| A_BD05 | Piano technician |
| B_AF01 | Doesn't work- mentioned he was a potter |
| B_AF02 | Airline Manager- background in theatrical set design and art history |
| B_AF03 | Solar Panel Inspector -mentioned he was a musician |
| B_AF04 | Retired -managed a fleet of trucks |
| B_AF05 | Musician |
| B_BD01 | Antiques Dealer |
| B_BD02 | Student |
| B_BD03 | Self-employed |
| B_BD04 | Retired teacher |
| B_BD05 | Student (Art) |

**Circle the number that best describes you…**

| | Not at All | | | | Somewhat | | | | Very much | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Interested in art (in general) | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |
| Knowledgeable of art (in general) | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |

| Visitor ID | Interest in Art | Knowledge of art |
|---|---|---|
| A_AF01 | 9 | 4.5 |
| A_AF02 | 5 | 4 |
| A_AF03 | 6 | 2 |
| A_AF04 | 9 | 3 |
| A_BD01 | 10 | 5 |
| A_BD02 | 8 | 6 |
| A_BD03 | 8 | 8 |
| A_BD04 | 5 | 4 |
| A_BD05 | 8 | 3 |
| B_AF01 | 10 | 6 |
| B_AF02 | 9 | 8 |
| B_AF03 | 10 | 8 |
| B_AF04 | 8.5 | 3.5 |
| B_AF05 | 10 | 7 |
| B_BD01 | 10 | 7 |
| B_BD02 | 8 | 3 |
| B_BD03 | 8 | 5 |
| B_BD04 | 8 | 5 |
| B_BD05 | 10 | 10 |
| **AVERAGE** | **8** | **5** |

# THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME!

# Crowdsourcing Visual Descriptions:

Appendix B: Summary of 57 Crowdsourced Verbal Descriptions

| Visitor ID | Object | Sequence | Start Time | End Time | Length (seconds) | Word Count |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| A-AF01 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | 0:13 | 0:41 | 28 | 39 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | 0:59 | 2:07 | 78 | 72 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 2:27 | 3:15 | 48 | 77 |
| A-AF02 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | 0:18 | 0:48 | 30 | 62 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | 1:04 | 1:47 | 43 | 71 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 2:32 | 3:20 | 48 | 80 |
| A-AF03 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | 0:11 | 0:48 | 37 | 76 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | 1:09 | 1:48 | 39 | 55 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 2:13 | 3:31 | 88 | 160 |
| A-AF04 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | 0:12 | 0:42 | 30 | 54 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | 0:53 | 1:31 | 38 | 53 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 1:51 | 2:36 | 45 | 109 |
| A-BD01 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | 0:18 | 0:42 | 24 | 40 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | 1:03 | 1:26 | 23 | 45 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 1:57 | 2:28 | 31 | 58 |
| A-BD02 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | 0:28 | 1:06 | 38 | 81 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | 1:29 | 2:18 | 49 | 71 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 2:39 | 3:29 | 50 | 113 |
| A-BD03 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | :19 | 1:21 | 62 | 119 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | 1:43 | 2:35 | 52 | 105 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 2:55 | 3:49 | 54 | 124 |
| A-BD04 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | :25 | 1:03 | 38 | 67 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | 1:23 | 2:06 | 43 | 72 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 2:25 | 3:13 | 48 | 114 |
| A-BD05 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | :21 | 1:16 | 55 | 128 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | 1:51 | 3:35 | 104 | 156 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 4:04 | 5:17 | 73 | 144 |
| B-AF01 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | :35 | 1:16 | 41 | 75 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | 1:31 | 2:41 | 70 | 122 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 3:08 | 3:56 | 48 | 115 |
| B-AF02 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | :18 | 1:32 | 74 | 180 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | 1:51 | 3:37 | 106 | 205 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 3:58 | 6:30 | 152 | 382 |
| B-AF03 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | :20 | 1:06 | 46 | 59 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | 1:23 | 2:02 | 39 | 54 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 2:32 | 3:28 | 56 | 99 |
| B-AF04 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | :15 | 1:22 | 67 | 77 |

| | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | Chandelier | 2 | 1:47 | 2:54 | 67 | 76 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 3:35 | 4:41 | 66 | 81 |
| B-AF05 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | :07 | :58 | 41 | 69 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | 1:26 | 1:48 | 22 | 42 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 2:17 | 3:14 | 57 | 46 |
| B-BD01 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | :16 | :26 | 10 | 7 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | :51 | 1:14 | 23 | 16 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 1:39 | 2:05 | 26 | 26 |
| B-BD02 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | :13 | :25 | 12 | 31 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | :38 | :57 | 19 | 39 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 1:15 | 1:37 | 22 | 52 |
| B-BD03 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | :18 | :43 | 25 | 50 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | 1:03 | 1:33 | 30 | 52 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 1:59 | 2:35 | 36 | 73 |
| B-BD04 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | :20 | 1:21 | 61 | 102 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | 1:50 | 3:47 | 117 | 148 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 4:16 | 5:37 | 81 | 180 |
| B-BD05 | Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen | 1 | :14 | 1:18 | 64 | 140 |
| | Chandelier | 2 | 1:36 | 2:51 | 75 | 124 |
| | Salem Common on Training Day | 3 | 3:23 | 4:52 | 89 | 221 |

## Totals per Object/Group: Average Length (in seconds) and Word Count

| By Object, then group | Average Length (Seconds) | Average Word Count |
|---|---|---|
| Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen: A | 38 | 74 |
| Portrait of Lucy Dodge Allen: B | 44 | 79 |
| Chandelier: A | 52 | 78 |
| Chandelier: B | 57 | 88 |
| Salem Common on Training Day: A | 54 | 109 |
| Salem Common on Training Day: B | 63 | 128 |

## Totals per Group: Average Length (in seconds) and Word Count

| By Group | Average Length (Seconds) | Average Word Count |
|---|---|---|
| A Total | 48 | 87 |
| B Total | 55 | 98 |